



REQUEST FOR ACTION BY BOARD OF SELECTMEN

DATE SUBMITTED: February 20, 2015	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION
DATE ACTION REQUESTED: February 23, 2015	<input type="checkbox"/> DISCUSSION ONLY
SUBJECT: Consultants Proposals – Long Sands Beach Master Plan Project	

DISCUSSION OF OPTIONS AVAILABLE TO THE BOARD: The RFP'S for Long Sands Beach Master Plan generated a great deal of interest and the Town received eight excellent proposals from multidisciplinary consulting firms and project teams. We have listed the competing firms below along with their total cost. Selectmen should note that three of the firms submitting proposals included construction administration services as part of their cost structure. These services were not specified in the RFP. With that in mind we have acknowledged it when applicable and deducted the cost to provide an accurate comparison for your review.

Ransom Consulting , Inc., Portland, Maine	109,879
Wright Pierce, Portland, Maine	152,580 94,500 (Less Con. Admin. -58,080)
BH2M, Gorham, Maine	155,400
Oak Point Associates, Biddeford, Maine	180,975 144,390 (Less Con. Admin. -36,585)
Woodard & Curran, Portland, Maine	229,725
Milone & MacBroom, Portland, Maine	233,779
Parsons & Brinckerhoff, Boston, Ma.	235,960 192,312 (Less Con. Admin. -43,648)
Kleinfelder, Augusta, Maine	240,000

The Review Committee included Mike Sullivan, Dean Lessard, Dylan Smith and Stu Dawson. Each member reviewed the proposals individually and ranked them based on the consultants understanding of the project, experience with similar projects, quality of staff, use of sub-consultants, cost, location of office and manager, references and misconduct. Once complete, the Committee met as a group to discuss the various aspects of each proposal and share observations, questions or concerns. Ultimately four finalists were selected and invited to give presentations and attend a Q&A session with the Review Committee, they were; Wright Pierce, Ransom Consulting, Oak Point Associates and Parsons and Brinckerhoff.

Concluding the presentations the field was narrowed to two finalists; Parsons and Brinkerhoff and Ransom Consulting. Individual meetings were held with both firms to further communications and discuss the consultants responsibilities in more detail. Consultants were allowed to adjust their estimates based on services added or deleted, depending on how they each bid the project. The Committee's goal was to establish a clear and transparent understanding of the services required and to insure there would be no surprises for either party once the contract was awarded. Parsons and Brinkerhoff revised their price to \$164,805.83 and Ransom Consulting revised their price to \$135,340.42. We have attached the revised proposals from both Firms.

The Committee is unanimous in its decision to recommend to the Board of Selectmen that they award the contract to Ransom Consulting, Inc. of Portland , Maine in the amount of \$135,340.42. We feel comfortable that the Firm has a good understanding of the project and has put forth a solid, cost effective proposal.

Another option available to the Board would be to select Parsons and Brinkerhoff as the Review Committee's second option. They presented themselves as a strong, experienced team and exhibited enthusiasm for the project. The Committee was impressed with the building architect. All things considered, it is fair to say that the deciding factor for the Committee was cost.

Finally, a third option for the Board would be to disregard the Committee's recommendations and start the review process from the beginning.

RECOMMENDATION: We recommend the Board award the contract for consulting services for the Long Sands Beach Master Plan Project to Ransom Consulting, Inc. of Portland, Maine in the amount of \$135,340.42.

PROPOSED MOTION: Move to award the contract for consulting services for the Long Sands Beach Master Plan Project to Ransom Consulting, Inc. of Portland, Maine in the amount of \$135,340.42.

FISCAL IMPACT: \$135,340.42

DEPARTMENT LINE ITEM ACCOUNT: Capital – Bathhouse, Drainage projects and MPI Grant.

BALANCE IN LINE ITEM IF APPROVED: \$1,651,660

PREPARED BY: _____ REVIEWED BY: _____

Table 1 - Costing

Tasks	Ransom			Mitchell & Assoc.		CWS Architects		TY LIN		Tilcomb Assoc.	Total
	Sr. Eng.	Proj. Eng.	CAD	Sr. LA	LA	Sr. Architect	Architect	Sr. Traffic Eng.	Traffic Eng.	Surveyor	
Data Coordination	\$2,970.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$634.76	\$665.68	\$750.00	\$5,020.44
Review of Survey Data										6	
Traffic courts								4	8		
Geotechnical borings	22										
Preliminary Design Reports	\$2,295.00	\$3,960.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$1,269.52	\$3,161.98	\$0.00	\$10,686.50
Traffic control plan		2						8	38		
Geotechnical investigation	15	2									
Drainage evaluation	2	32									
Permitting	\$1,080.00	\$7,920.00	\$600.00	\$750.00	\$1,700.00	\$1,300.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$13,350.00
Bathhouse	6	40	8	6	20	10					
Drainage	2	32									
Conceptual Plan - 30%	\$270.00	\$4,400.00	\$3,000.00	\$2,125.00	\$5,100.00	\$2,340.00	\$2,040.00	\$1,586.90	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$20,861.90
3 concepts/street	2	32	40	4	16			8			
3 concepts/bathhouse				12	36	18	24				
Cost Estimate		8		1	8			2			
Preliminary Design - 50%	\$0.00	\$7,920.00	\$3,000.00	\$1,500.00	\$5,440.00	\$1,560.00	\$4,250.00	\$1,269.52	\$1,331.36	\$0.00	\$26,270.88
Bathhouse						12	50				
Realien/intersection		32	18					4	8		
Parkings/ped./bicycles		24	18	6	20			4	8		
Streetscape/landscape				6	44						
Drainage		16	4								
Final Design - 100%	\$405.00	\$4,840.00	\$3,600.00	\$750.00	\$3,060.00	\$4,160.00	\$14,110.00	\$634.76	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$31,559.76
Bathhouse						32	166				
Plan and profile	2	36	20					4			
Drainage/erosion control	1	4	4								
Landscape				4	24						
Details		4	24	2	12						
Construction Administration	\$405.00	\$2,640.00	\$0.00	\$250.00	\$680.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$3,975.00
Bid docs	2	20		1	8						
Bid review and recom.	1	4		1							
Meetings	\$4,860.00	\$440.00	\$0.00	\$4,750.00	\$0.00	\$4,940.00	\$0.00	\$4,125.94	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$19,115.94
Selectmen (3)	12			12		12		12			
Public (3)	12			12		12		12			
Building Committee (3)	12			12		12		12			
Pre-Bid meeting		4		2		2		2			
Totals	\$12,285.00	\$32,120.00	\$10,200.00	\$10,125.00	\$15,980.00	\$14,300.00	\$20,400.00	\$9,521.40	\$5,159.02	\$750.00	\$130,840.42
Rendering Allowance (if requested)											
3D Plan (up to 3)					\$1,500	\$3,000.00					\$4,500.00
										Total with Allowance	\$135,340.42

Long Sands Beach Masterplan, Design & Construction Bid Documentation

REV 3: Feb. 18, 2015

Parsons Brinckerhoff

Task	Firm	Parsons Brinckerhoff													(Subconsultant) Alus Engineering, Inc	(Subconsultant) Lassel Architects, PA	(Subconsultant) Woodburn & Co. Landscape Architecture, LLC	(Subconsultant to Lassel Architects) Bennet Engineering, Inc	Total Hrs	Direct Labor Costs				
		Backlund - Project Manager	Allen Clarke - Traffic Engineer	Lee Chandler - Railway Engineer	Beth Turner - Asst. Traffic Engineer	Lisa Schmitt - Transportation Planner	Steve Barwood - Supervising Geotechnical Engineer	Dave D'Angelo - Senior Geotechnical Engineer	Tim Curran - Bridge Inspection	Coop - Engineering Intern	Alf Dillhoff - Permitting Lead	Ron Beal - Asst. Permitting Engineer	Principal	Architect	Intern	RW Principal	VM Land Des	Drill			Designer	Engineer	Draft	Admin
Direct Labor Rate (Current)		\$77.00	\$40.01	\$33.80	\$31.08	\$37.69	\$63.99	\$64.87	\$47.05	\$18.00	\$57.00	\$43.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A			
All-in Rate (including Fee, Overhead, and Escalation)		\$121.62	\$115.12	\$97.26	\$89.43	\$108.45	\$212.47	\$157.89	\$132.39	\$51.80	\$125.46	\$94.60	\$148.00	\$115.00	\$100.00	\$75.00	\$60.00	\$115.00	\$135.00	\$85.00	\$75.00			
Task 1: Project Startup and Existing Conditions Inventory																						0	\$ -	
1.01 Startup		4	4	4									4			7	6					29	\$ 3,465.99	
1.02 Supplemental Topographic Survey (if needed)																						0	\$ -	
1.03 Geotechnical Investigations							2	4	12	14												33	\$ 3,619.61	
1.04 Traffic Data				2	8																	10	\$ 909.93	
Task 2: Project Outreach		44											10		10	5						69	\$ 12,576.24	
Task 3: Concept Design		8	4	2	4	8						40	24	20	40	24						174	\$ 20,013.24	
3.01 Development of Alternatives		2		16																		18	\$ 1,999.57	
3.02 Drainage Design Concepts		2	4	24	16				48			15	30	32	16	30	32	5	3			258	\$ 27,874.99	
3.03 Design Development (25%)		1	2	4	6	24						8	4		8	2						59	\$ 6,550.22	
3.04 Preliminary Design Report																						0	\$ -	
Task 4: Final Design		10	8	52	40	6			100			24	24	60	16	8		20	12	8	1	348	\$ 27,202.02	
4.01 Roadway Final Design																						177	\$ 20,001.48	
4.02 Bathhouse Final Design																						0	\$ -	
Task 5: Permitting and Approvals		8				48				20		4	8	8								96	\$ 11,786.49	
5.01 Preparation of Permit Applications																						80	\$ 11,840.38	
5.02 Meetings with Town Boards and Committees		20								20		20			20							0	\$ -	
Task 6: Bid Phase Services				8								3	3									14	\$ 1,558.07	
6.01 Pre-Bid Conference		4	1	4								4	12		2							27	\$ 3,550.63	
6.02 Respond to Questions and Prepare Addenda		1	0	6								4	4									15	\$ 1,845.17	
6.03 Evaluation Bids/Recommendation to Award																								
Task 7: Construction Phase Services																								
7.01 Pre-Construction Conference																								
7.02 Review of Submittals																								
7.03 Review of Requests for Information (RFIs)																								
7.04 Progress Meetings																								
7.05 Site Visits																								
7.06 Review of Contractor Pay Applications																								
7.07 Review of Claims, Proposed Change Orders and Final Change Orders																								
7.08 Semi-Final and Final Inspection																								
7.09 Record Documents																								
7.10 Provision of Resident Inspection Services																								
Totals - All Tasks		108	23	123	74	86	2	4	12	162	40	0	137	109	120	143	123	92	25	15	8	1	1607	\$ 149,793.83

Revisions:	1	2/11/2015	Deleted costs for Construction Phase Services (Task 7)	Expenses	\$ 15,012.00
	2	2/12/2015	Revised costs per understanding from meeting with Town on 2/12/15		
	3	2/18/2015	Revised based on discussion with Town of York on 2/18/15		
Total Project Cost					\$ 164,805.83